

Florida High Schools Model United Nations

# **GULF COAST 10**

## UNITED NATIONS EDUCATIONAL SCIENTIFIC AND CULTURAL ORGANIZATION (UNESCO)

## DIGITAL EQUITY IN EDUCATION AND CULTURE

Authors: Paloma Dean, Yara Elrebey, Ricardo Fernandes, Diyar Sara, Fay Zhao, and Charlie Barrett September 2024

#### Background

Digital equity is the idea that everyone worldwide has access to the digital tools they need to participate in society. Thus, digital inequity is the disparity in access, knowledge, and ability to use digital tools and technologies. Digital inequity primarily impacts lower-income individuals and underdeveloped countries. Only two-thirds of the world's population has access to modern technologies, leaving roughly 2.6 billion people without fast internet<sup>1</sup>. The goal when pursuing digital equity is to decrease this number.

In the new digital age, efficient methods of spreading information and educating individuals through technology have become more widespread. However, there is still a large discrepancy between nations with access to these tools and those without access. A lack of equity in these resources leads to compounding disparities in the development of nations, which is why it is essential to make it a priority to close this gap. Digital equity in education and culture is necessary for several reasons: first, access to broadband internet dramatically increases the number of resources individuals have access to, and second, it ensures that every person is on equal footing regarding digital participation resources.

#### **Digital Education**

The internet can play a significant role in modern education; access to digital learning can be a beneficial tool in situations —like the recent COVID-19 pandemic—where in-person learning becomes difficult or dangerous; if communities have easy access to the Internet, they can continue learning through these situations, if they do not have easy access to quality internet they may not be able to keep up with their education. Additionally, access to broadband internet increases the number of resources a student has access to—online journals, videos, and even textbooks are all easily accessible online but may be challenging to come across physically. To address the issue of digital equity in education, the United Nations incorporated a dedicated goal in the 2030 Agenda. Sustainable Development Goal 4 (SDG 4) aims to "ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all."<sup>2</sup>

#### Sudan Case Study: Digital Passport

The UN has taken action to promote SDG 4 and equitable learning. In 2020, UNICEF partnered with Microsoft to create a digital, offline education program called the Learning Passport<sup>3</sup> for school-aged children. The Learning Passport has programs in over 29 countries and is focused on providing quality education in countries where the education system has been disrupted. One of the countries participating in the Learning Passport is Sudan<sup>4</sup>. Since 2008, Sudan has made significant improvements in primary education. Sudan has opened up over

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Pelchen, Lexie. "Internet Usage Statistics In 2024." Forbes. Last modified March 1, 2024. Accessed September 19, 2024. https://www.forbes .com/home-improvement/internet/internet-statistics/#:~:text=Key%20Internet%20Statistics&text=Out%20of%20the%20nearly%208,the%20inter net%2C%20according%20to%20Statista.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> "Sustainable Development Goal 4 (SDG4)." UNESCO.org. Accessed September 21, 2024. https://www.unesco.org/sdg4education2030/en/sdg4. <sup>3</sup> United Nations. "About the Learning Passport." Learning Passport. Accessed September 19, 2024. https://www.learningpassport.org/about-learning-passport.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> "Education in Sudan." UNICEF. Accessed September 19, 2024. https://www.unicef.org/sudan/education.

2,800 schools, enabling one million more Sudanese children to access education. Due to these efforts, the number of students completing primary education and advancing to secondary education has increased to 336 thousand annually<sup>5</sup>.

In recent years, Sudan has become one of the worst education crises in the world<sup>6</sup>; the COVID-19 pandemic and intense political instability have resulted in extended school closures and obstructed the education of the 15 million plus children living in Sudan<sup>7</sup>. Female children are especially vulnerable as the political and economic stress of the last few years has intensified the gender inequality in Sudan.

To combat these setbacks, in October 2021, Sudan became the fourteenth country to join the Learning Passport<sup>8</sup>. The program contains over 1,400 visual modules, over 2,200 interactive activities in Sudanese Arabic, and PDF versions of government textbooks. The Sudanese government has also installed touchscreens connected to the Learning Passport in public areas such as Mosques, markets, and other easily accessible spaces so that children without home access to technology can still benefit from the Learning Passport. In addition to the Learning Passport, UNICEF has opened Makenna ("Our Space") centers across Sudan<sup>9</sup>. These centers are hubs for structured learning, Learning Passport modules, and social support for children. The Sudanese Learning Passport is not just for learners living in Sudan; UNICEF has partnered with other countries with a high concentration of Sudanese refugees to make the Learning Passport available to internationally displaced Sudanese learners. The Sudanese government, UNICEF, and many other countries are using technology and digital advancements to rebuild and sustain Sudan's education system and the nearly 15 million students affected by political instability, COVID-19, and the lack of internet access in the country.

#### **Covid Case Study: Online learning**

Additionally, in light of COVID-19, multiple nations have collaborated to take the initiative to curb the negative effects the pandemic has had on education. Through UNESCO, governments have come together to provide parents, teachers, and students with accessible solutions to digital learning through the launch of a global partnership. The coalition contributing the resources, expertise, and connectivity necessary to act on the goals of this organization includes ITU (the UN agency for digital technologies), Microsoft, GSMA, Weidong, Google, Facebook, Zoom, KPMG, and Coursera<sup>10</sup>.

Similarly, individual nations have also made strides in closing the digital education divide in light of the COVID-19 pandemic. China, for example, provided computers, mobile data

https://datareportal.com/reports/digital-2024-sudan.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> "Digital 2024: Sudan." Datareportal. Last modified February 2024. Accessed September 19, 2024.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> "Sudan's 19 Million Learners are Facing the World's Worst Education Crisis." Learning Passport. Last modified April 2024. Accessed September 19, 2024. https://www.learningpassport.org/stories/sudans-19-million-learners-are-facing-worlds-worst-education-crisis.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Elkamel, Mohammed, and Abdelrahman Maalla. *Education in Sudan: A Statistical Overview Before and After the Outbreak of War*. Atar, 2024. Accessed September 19, 2024.

https://atarnetwork.com/wp-content/uploads/2024/06/ATAR-English-Issue-7-Education-in-Sudan-A-Statistical-Overview-Before-and-After-the-Outbreak-of-War.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup>"Education in Sudan." UNICEF. Accessed September 19, 2024. https://www.unicef.org/sudan/education.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Elkamel, Mohammed, and Abdelrahman Maalla. *Education in Sudan: A Statistical Overview Before and After the Outbreak of War*. Atar, 2024. Accessed September 19, 2024. https://atarnetwork.com/wp-content/uploads/2024/06/ATAR-English-Issue-7-Education-in-Sudan-A-Statistical-Overview-Before-and-After-the-Outbreak-of-War.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> "COVID-19: Here's How Some Countries Are Addressing the Digital Education Divide." 2020. ITU Hub. May 6, 2020.

https://www.itu.int/hub/2020/05/covid-19-heres-how-some- countries-are-addressing-the-digital-education-divide/.

packages, and telecommunication subsidies to students from low-income families<sup>11</sup>. Italy also worked to support distance learning for 8.5 million students and improve connectivity in isolated areas by funding an 85 million Euro grant. Portugal, on the other hand, suggested a partnership with postal companies to deliver paper worksheets to homes of students who do not have access to digital education tools. The United Arab Emirates took a different approach to the issue by establishing a hotline for teachers and students to receive technical support when encountering difficulties. Meanwhile, in Washington State, schools are discouraged from offering online learning services unless they can guarantee equitable access for all students<sup>12</sup>.

#### Culture

Digital inequity also plays a vital role in spreading and preserving culture: internet access can provide communities with the opportunities to practice their languages, maintain their traditions, and record their heritage with members of the same culture worldwide. Furthermore, the internet has allowed for syncretism—the spread, exchange, and blending of different cultures. With these goals in mind, many countries have started programs digitizing their museum collections and cultural sites. For instance, China's Mogao Caves, a UNESCO World Heritage site, has been digitally documented through initiatives such as the International Dunhuang Project (IDP)—a global collaboration aiming to make high-resolution images of the caves' Buddhist paintings, manuscripts, and artifacts available online, ensuring their preservation and accessibility while protecting the physical site from the wear and tear of tourism.<sup>13,14</sup> A similar example of digitalization preserving history amid destruction can be seen in Brazil, as a 2018 fire destroyed 80-90% of the National Museum in Rio de Janeiro's collection, erasing millions of artifacts that would have been lost to history had it not been for part of its collection being digitized.<sup>15</sup> Using the Internet as a means of preserving language, the San Carlos and White Mountain Apache Indigenous people are using recording technologies and online dictionaries to digitize and preserve their endangered language, Western Apache.<sup>16</sup>

However, cultures-particularly in Least Developed Countries (LDCs)-without access and stakes in these digital resources face the risk of deletion; their customs and histories are wiped by globalization. In a document defining digital inclusion, the UN highlights that the digital divide not only contributes to the manifestation and amplification of cultural disparities but also extends beyond the simple distinction between people online and people offline; these cultural gaps and barriers are shaped not just by access to internet resources but also by who controls them. The document emphasizes how "many digital spaces reflect the preferences, bias, and motivations of those who throughout the years have had the most opportunities to access

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> GEM Report, 2020. "How Are Countries Addressing the Covid-19 Challenges in Education? A Snapshot of Policy Measures - World Education Blog." World Education Blog. March 24, 2020. https://world-education-blog.org/2020/03/24/how-are-countries-addressing-the-

covid-19-challenges-in-education-a-snapshot-of-policy-measures/#:~:text=To%20ease%20the%20disruption%2C%20the. <sup>12</sup> "Chapter 28a.250 RCW: ONLINE LEARNING." 2017. Wa.gov. 2017. https://apps.leg.wa.gov /rcw/default.aspx?cite=28a.250&full=true#:~:text=(1)%20The%20legislature%20finds%20that.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Jane O'Brien, "Digital Chinese Caves Preserve History," BBC News, January 6, 2013, https://www.bbc.com/news/magazine-20802947.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup>"About the International Dunhuang Programme," IDP, accessed September 22, 2024, https://idp.bl.uk/about/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup>"Cutting Edge: Protecting and Preserving Cultural Diversity in the Digital Era," UNESCO.org, October 28, 2020, https://www.unesco.org/en/articles/cutting-edge-protecting-and-preserving-cultural-diversity-digital-era.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Daley, Patti. "Endangered Language." Globe Miami Times. Last modified July 2019. Accessed September 19, 2024.

https://www.globemiamitimes.com/endangered-language/.

computers and the Internet [resulting] in technology design [privileging] some, for example, men over women, urban over rural, and elites over those economically disadvantaged."<sup>17</sup>

The Secretary General of the International Federation of Coalitions for Cultural Diversity, Marie-Julie Desrochers, discusses these biases in digital influence by claiming that "American content is consistently overconsumed," with algorithms substantially spreading United States-centric culture and the English language globally, overshadowing local cultures.<sup>18</sup> This is a phenomenon known as media imperialism—referring to the dominance of one nation's media and cultural products over another, projecting the norms, cultures, and values represented by the country controlling the media onto the country being influenced, eroding local cultures, traditions, and media practices. Thus, allowing access to technology is not enough to ensure digital equity. The same resources responsible for bridging the gap between nations and cultures may inadvertently limit diverse consumption by promoting biased exposure. To truly address the digital and cultural divide, it is essential to adjust the creation and discoverability of digital content with a focus on cultural inclusivity.

#### **Case Study: Nigeria**

The ramifications of media imperialism can be seen in Nigeria, as their most significant local film industry, Nollywood, competes with American media's dominance. Nollywood emerged in the early 1990s, sparking rapid growth in producing low-budget, high-volume films that resonated with local audiences. UNESCO's Institute for Statistics declared that by 2009, Nollywood was producing more films than Hollywood, becoming the second-largest film industry in the world by volume.<sup>19</sup> However, in 2020, Netflix launched in Nigeria, bringing a surge of American films and TV shows to the country.<sup>20</sup> With its algorithmic preferences for Western content, Netflix became a powerful competitor to Nollywood, especially among Nigeria's growing urban middle class, drawn to Hollywood's higher production values and global appeal. While Nollywood still dominates African cinema—and has created Nigerian movies in collaboration with Netflix— the influx of American media is gradually creating challenges for Nollywood in retaining domestic viewership, as more Nigerians turn to foreign content for entertainment, leading to concerns over cultural erosion.

The impact of American media is also reflected in Nigeria's language use. As researchers at the University of Lagos present, "the amalgamation [or combination] of the Northern and the Southern Protectorates of Nigeria in 1914 [under British colonial rule] turned the various ethnic and linguistic nationalities into nation states under the British colonial rule with the imposition of English language as official language of administration, commerce/business and other official

<sup>18</sup> "Cultural Diversity in the Digital Age: A Pillar for Sustainable Development." United Nations. Accessed September 2024. https://www.un.org/en/un-chronicle/cultural-diversity-digital-age-pillar-sustainable-development.

<sup>20</sup>Nelson C.J., "Blood Sisters' Is the Nigerian Thriller You're Sleeping On," Teen Vogue, December 8, 2022,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> "Digital Inclusion." United Nations. Accessed September 2024.

 $https://www.un.org/techenvoy/sites/www.un.org.techenvoy/files/general/Definition_Digital-Inclusion.pdf.$ 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup>"Nigeria Surpasses Hollywood as World's Second Largest Film Producer – UN | UN News," United Nations, May 5, 2005,

https://news.un.org/en/story/2009/05/299102-nigeria-surpasses-hollywood-worlds-second-largest-film-producer-un.

 $https://www.teenvogue.com/story/netflix-nigeria-blood-sisters-nollywood-future \#: \sim: text = The\%20 storyline\%20 lacked\%20 tension\%2C\%20 the, that t%20 make\%20 up\%20 the\%20 cast.$ 

transactions."<sup>21</sup> After Nigerian independence in 1960, the government kept English as an official language due to the country's multilingual nature.<sup>22</sup> In attempts to counter the erosion of local languages, Nigeria's National Policy on Education mandated that since 1977, "children should be taught in their mother tongue or the 'language of the immediate community' in the foundational stages of primary school,"<sup>23</sup> yet this policy has not been implemented efficiently, with the previous study from the University of Lagos indicating that "most young Nigerians cannot speak their mother tongues … because their parents and their schools simply discourage children from speaking them at home and school respectively where the Indigenous languages are termed 'vernaculars.'"<sup>24</sup> The dominance of English continues to be reinforced by the increasing consumption of American media and the rise of social media platforms. Platforms like Instagram, Twitter, and TikTok, widely adopted in Nigeria in the 2010s, primarily use English and promote Western cultural norms. This has contributed to the decline of native languages like Efik, Ibibio, Igbo, Yoruba, and thus, their cultures. This shift reflects the deepening influence of American media on Nigerian culture and language.

#### **Groups Impacted**

It is vital to understand what factors are determining the discrepancies in order to understand the extent to which digital equity is affected by culture. Research indicates that groups favored by the government tend to have better internet access than the rest of the population. Meanwhile, it may be these same groups that benefit the most by utilizing digital advancements to preserve their culture and promote ethnic inclusion, as demonstrated by the Apache tribes in Arizona that employ online dictionaries and recording technology to conserve their unique language.<sup>25</sup>

The digital divide is additionally apparent along economic lines, suggesting that lower-income communities and less-developed countries often lack internet infrastructure and access. Research conducted by UNESCO determined that over 60% of individuals in developing countries lack internet access; when comparing this to the 2-30% of people in developed countries without internet- the extent of the divide is evident.<sup>26</sup> This redirects attention back to the systemic flaw in digital accessibility/ distribution.<sup>27</sup>

#### **Artificial Intelligence**

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup>Osoba, Joseph Babasola, and Tajudeen Afolabi Alebiosu. "Language Preference as a Precursor to Displacement and Extinction in Nigeria: The Roles of English Language and Nigerian Pidgin." Journal of Universal Language 17, no. 2 (September 2016): 111–43. https://doi.org/10.22425/jul.2016.17.2.111.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup>Thelma Ebube Obiakor, "Language of Instruction Policy in Nigeria: Assessing Implementation and Literacy Achievement in a Multilingual Environment," Science Direct, August 17, 2024, https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0738059324001342#:~:text=Since% 201977%2C%20the%20Nigerian%20official,%E2%80%9D%20(Adamu%2C%202022).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Osoba, Joseph Babasola, and Tajudeen Afolabi Alebiosu. "Language Preference as a Precursor to Displacement and Extinction in Nigeria: The Roles of English Language and Nigerian Pidgin." Journal of Universal Language 17, no. 2 (September 2016): 111–43. https://doi.org/10.22425 /jul.2016.17.2.111.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> "A/HRC/17/27 General Assembly." OHCHR, May 2011. https://www2.ohchr.org/english/bodies/hrcouncil/docs/17session/A.HRC.17.27\_en.pdf.
<sup>26</sup> "Economic Effects of the Digital Divide: Unlocking Growth with Equitable Access." Connecting the Unconnected, November 15,2022. https://ctu.ieee.org/economic-effects-of-the-digital-divide-unlocking-growth-with-equitable-access/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Weidmann, Benitez-Baleato, Hunziker, Glatz, and Dimitropoulos. "Digital Discrimination: Political Bias in Internet Service Provision across Ethnic Groups." Science | AAAS, September 9, 2016. https://www.science.org/doi/10.1126/science.aaf5062.

Artificial intelligence is debated among changemakers as a means of bridging both digital and cultural divides, especially with the development of translation tools that would allow individuals who only speak their local languages to participate and communicate in the global digital sphere. This AI function is demonstrated in platforms like Instagram, where comments written under a post in another language can be instantaneously translated and read by the platform user. However, there is the concern that AI imposes ethical concerns amongst the population, including the limiting of cultural and expressive rights.<sup>28</sup> Nevertheless, fixing these concerns and cooperating to develop safe and responsible utilization of Artificial Intelligence across the globe is suspected to be a powerful tool in establishing digital equity and cooperation concerning culture. Secretary-General Antonio Guterres highlights artificial intelligence as one of the eight critical areas of action to achieve digital cooperation.<sup>29</sup> Doing this is a stepping stone in establishing and maintaining trust in the digital environment to expand digital collaboration. This means the combating of cybercrime and the protection of digital human rights must be properly assured and addressed before the digital divide begins to narrow.<sup>30</sup>

### **Education with SDG-4**

In 2015, as part of the Incheon Declaration, 184 member states in the United Nations Educational Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) adopted the Education 2030 Framework for Action to implement SDG-4.<sup>31</sup> The framework consists of 10 goals that collectively focus on creating educational equity in quality, technology, and more. The framework proposes possible development strategies, funding, and coordination for countries to implement. UNESCO also conducts the Global Education Monitoring (GEM) report annually to track each country's progress towards improving learning experiences and digital transformation.<sup>32</sup> For example, Germany reported allocating 6.5 billion euros to enhance digital infrastructure across 40,000 schools, while Andorra highlighted new strategies within their country to improve digital skills and teacher support.<sup>33</sup>

#### **Collaboration in SDG-17**

SDG-17 aims to "strengthen the means of implementation and revitalize the Global Partnership for sustainable development."<sup>34</sup> Understanding the role of global collaboration in change-making is crucial. Building upon the outlines, priorities, and perspectives of different

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> "Cultural Diversity in the Digital Age: A Pillar for Sustainable Development." United Nations. Accessed September 2024. https://www.un.org/ en/un-chronicle/cultural-diversity-digital-age-pillar-sustainable-development.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> "SECRETARY-GENERAL'S ROADMAP FOR DIGITAL COOPERATION." United Nations. Accessed September 19, 2024. https://www.un.org/en/content/digital-cooperation- roadmap/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> "WAVERING RESOLUTIONS: THE UN SECURITY COUNCIL ON DIGITAL RIGHTS." Access Now. Last modified 2024. Accessed September 19, 2024. https://www.accessnow.org/wp-content/uploads/2024/07/UN-Security-Council-in-the-digital-age-technical-report.pdf. <sup>31</sup> "Education 2030: Incheon Declaration and Framework for Action towards Inclusive and Equitable Quality Education and Lifelong Learning for All." UNESCO IITE, March 13, 2018. https://iite.unesco.org/publications/education-2030-incheon-declaration-framework-action-towardsinclusive-equitable-quality-education-lifelong-learning/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> "Technology in Education." UNESCO.org. Accessed September 21, 2024. https://www.unesco.org/gem-report/en.

UNESCO. "Transforming Education towards SDG4: Report of a Global Survey on Country Actions to Transform Education; Highlights." Transforming education towards SDG4, 2024. https://doi.org/10.54675/spp15672.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup>Ibid

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> "Goal 17 | Department of Economic and Social Affairs." United Nations. Accessed September 21, 2024. https://sdgs.un.org/goals/goal17.

leaders and nations allows the international community to implement a more inclusive and holistic approach to addressing international affairs. UNESCO launched the Global Education Coalition in 2020 to protect education through more than 200 partnerships with governments, international organizations, NGOs, and private companies.<sup>35</sup> Government-sponsored advancements towards accomplishing UN-wide established goals are imperative for nations' collaboration to even the digital equity field. However, policy and government is not the only solutions: private-public partnerships and NGOs provide a different perspective and approach where aid is provided for those in need on all fronts. NGOs such as Team4Tech support more than 90 countries and 700 other NGOs, providing \$550,000 in services and resources to improve the quality of education and bridge the digital divide alongside each nation's policies.<sup>36</sup>

## **Call to Action**

One-third of the world's population does not have access to modern technology. Even more people, primarily in low-income communities and emerging nations, have in-equitable access to the digital technology and information infrastructure that members of developed nations have access to<sup>37</sup>. When closing the digital divide, the international community must recognize the difference between "equity" and "equality." Every situation is different, and the UN needs to work within different cultures, mindsets, behaviors, and economic conditions to ensure that communities worldwide can digitally connect with and participate in society, education, and their cultures on an even footing with the rest of the world.

## **Questions for Research**

- 1. What challenges has your country faced when trying to achieve digital equity?
- 2. What factors have contributed to the successful passage of past resolutions but their ineffective execution?
- 3. How are citizens of your country being affected by digital inequity?
- 4. What solutions has your country put in place to help achieve digital equity? How can these measures be applied to the committee?

## **Guiding Questions For Debate**

- 1. How can the UN keep track of countries' progress towards digital equity ?
- 2. How can governments with limited funds keep up with the rest of the world when moving towards digital equity?
- 3. What previous initiatives have contributed towards closing the digital divide? Can these initiatives be expanded?
- 4. How can the committee work with the private sector towards achieving digital equity?

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> "Global Education Coalition." Home - Global Education Coalition. Accessed September 21, 2024. https://globaleducationcoalition.unesco.org/.
<sup>36</sup> "Education Nonprofit Impact Accelerator: Non-Profit Organization." Team4Tech, September 17, 2024. https://team4tech.org/education-focused-nonprofit-accelerator/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Pelchen, Lexie. "Internet Usage Statistics In 2024." Forbes. Last modified March 1, 2024. Accessed September 19, 2024. https://www.forbes .com/home-improvement/internet/internet-statistics/#:~:text=Key%20Internet%20Statistics&text=Out%20of%20the%20nearly%208,the%20inter net%2C%20according%20to%20Statista.